

Minutes of the Meeting of the Planning Committee, St Ives Town Council held in the Council Chamber, The Guildhall, St Ives on Thursday 21 June 2018 at 7.00pm.

PRESENT

Chairman – Councillor J Symons  
Vice Chairman – Councillor R Lait

COUNCILLORS

Glanville R	Mitchell A
Griffin J	Tanner J
Lait R	Tanner S
Messenger K	Williams T

OFFICERS

Administrative Assistant

APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

None.

P.146 MINUTES

RESOLVED – that the Chairman signs as a true and correct record the Minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 24 May 2018.

P.147 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Councillor Lait declared an interest in Item no. 3331 - PA18/0447 Blackbird Studio, Steeple Lane, St Ives - as a friend of the applicant and withdrew from the meeting during consideration of this item.

Councillor Symons declared an interest in Item no. 3332 – PA18/05495 Cubit Lodge, Access Track to Trevethoe from St Ives Road, Trevethoe, Lelant - as a close neighbour to the applicant and withdrew from the meeting during consideration of this item.

P.148 PUBLIC SPEAKING

PA18/05396 – 3 Albany Terrace, St Ives – Certificate of lawfulness for existing use of a property as a dwelling and not a guest house. One speaker in support of the application.

PA18/04358 – Land North of Number 10 Wheal Speed Road, Carbis Bay – Outline planning permission with all matters reserved. Bungalow and detached garage. One speaker in support of application.

PA18/03705 – St Ives School, Higher Tregenna Road, St Ives – Hybrid application comprising: Full permission for the provision of a new Multi Use Game Area (MUGA), resurfacing of the existing courts, and creation of a parking area. Outline permission for the erection of a clubhouse and sports stores. One speaker in support of application.

PA18/05208 – 31 St Johns Walk, St Ives – Two storey rear extension and front porch. One speaker in support of application.

Plots 4-8 and Plots 1-7 and 9-16 - Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives PA18/04258-PA18/0427 and PA18/04100 – Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds. One speaker in support of application.

P.149 PLANNING APPLICATIONS

**RESOLVED - that the Head of Development Management (Cornwall Council) be informed of the Council's observations on the planning applications set out in Annex 1 to these minutes.**

P.150 NEIGHBOURHOOD DEVELOPMENT PLAN REVIEW GROUP UPDATES AND ITEMS FOR DECISION

Councillor Lait briefed members of the committee with news from the Neighbourhood Development Plan Review Group.

The Neighbourhood Development Plan 12-month Review will soon be presented to Council for decision. A group of volunteers, including Councillors – are currently looking at ideas on how to approach the Neighbourhood Development Plan's next landmark – the 5 - year Review. Councillor Lait explained that Neighbourhood Development Plan Policies are being monitored constantly, but alternative ideas are actively encouraged to cover every eventuality. Volunteers are needed to assist with working towards the 5- year review and any offers of assistance would be gratefully received.

P.151 PA14/03546 - Land adjacent to Tyingham Road, Lelant, St Ives

Councillor Symons withdrew from the meeting during discussions as a neighbour of the applicant.

Councillor Garrod circulated correspondence in relation to the Economic Viability Assessment (outline only) for Land NE of Tyingham, Road, Lelant. PA14/03546 (Outline Planning), APP/D/0840/A/14/2229298. (Appeal. Planning Inspectorate), PA16/03063 (Reserve Matters) and requested legal guidance.

RESOLVED – that the item be deferred until the next meeting, enabling Councillor Mitchell to make initial enquiries at County Hall.

P.152 ST IVES PLANNING APPLICATIONS TO BE DETERMINED BY CORNWALL COUNCIL – WEST SUB- AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

None.

P.153 CORRESPONDENCE

Correspondence relating to planning applications had been circulated and available to councillors during consideration of the applications.

Meeting closed at 9.28 pm

Chairman



St Ives Town Council  
 Planning Schedule for meeting date 21 June 2018

<b>Ref No.</b>	<b>CC Ref</b>	<b>Site (Applicant)</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Observations</b>
3302	PA18/05396	3 Albany Terrace, St Ives (Mrs Tamsin Thompson)	Certificate of lawfulness for existing use of property as a dwelling and not a guest house	Application supported.
3318	PA18/04358	Land North of Number 10 Wheal Speed Road, Wheal Speed Road, Carbis Bay (Mr Ward)	Outline planning permission with all matters reserved. Bungalow and detached garage.	No objection providing NDP policies H2, T2 and BE17 adhered to.
3325	PA18/03705	St Ives School, Higher Tregenna Road, St Ives (Mr Martin Potter, St Ives Tennis Club)	Hybrid application comprising: Full permission for the provision of a new Multi Use Games Area (MUGA), resurfacing of the existing courts, and creation of a parking area. Outline permission for the erection of a clubhouse and sports stores.	Application supported.
3323	PA18/05208	31 St Johns Walk, St Ives (Mr and Mrs McGregor)	Two storey rear extension and front porch	Objection.  Loss of light. Unneighbourly (2-storey proposal right up against boundary of neighbouring house). Overdevelopment.  Contrary to policy GD1.
3306	PA18/04260	New Residential Units, Plots 4-8, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives (Christian Guild Holidays)	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Units 4-8 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b>  Objection on every level. Design abysmal and detrimental to surrounding area.  Contrary to GD1.

3306A	PA18/04100	New Residential Units, Plots 4-8, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Units 4-8 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Poor design. Inappropriate for location. Detrimental impact on surrounding area. Adhere to previous comments – detrimental to character of hotel, style out of keeping and inappropriate for surroundings. Situated too close to the road. Very important to preserve the green corridor – this will have a strong detrimental visual impact.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1.</p>
3307	PA18/04257	New Residential Units Plot 1, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 1 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Out of keeping, poor design, concerns over loss of tree cover in place of grass. In close proximity to the Huer's Hut, therefore detrimental to setting of listed building. Agree with Planning Officer's comments with regards to quality of designs.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1 and CH1.</p>
3308	PA18/04258	New Residential Units Plot 2, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 2 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Out of keeping, poor design, concerns over loss of tree cover in place of grass. In close proximity to Huers Hut, therefore detrimental to setting of</p>

				<p>listed building. Agree with Planning Officer's comments with regards to quality of designs.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1 and CH1</p>
3309	PA18/04259	New Residential Units Plot 3, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 3 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Out of keeping, poor design, concerns over loss of tree cover in place of grass. In close proximity to Huers Hut, therefore detrimental to setting of listed building. Agree with Planning Officer's comments with regards to quality of designs.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1 and CH1</p>
3310	PA18/04261	New Residential Units Plot 9, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 9 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Out of keeping, poor design, concerns over loss of tree cover in place of grass. Agree with Planning Officer's comments with regards to quality of designs.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1.</p>
3311	PA18/04262	New Residential Units Plot 10 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 10 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Poor design. Detrimental impact on surrounding area.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1.</p>

3312	PA18/04266	New Residential Units Plot 11 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 11 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	Application supported.
3313	PA18/04267	New Residential Units Plot 12 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 12 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Inconsistent design. Property design does not work visually. Looks like a house with many additions. Bulk, mass, sizing issues.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1</p>
3314	PA18/04268	New Residential Units Plot 13 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 13 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Inconsistent design. Property design visually does not work. Looks like a house with many additions. Bulk, mass, sizing issues.</p> <p>Contrary to GD1</p>
3315	PA18/04269	New Residential Units Plot 14 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 14 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in	<p><b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b></p> <p>Poor design. Inappropriate for location. Detrimental impact on surrounding area.</p>

			hotel grounds	Contrary to GD1
3316	PA18/04270	New Residential Units Plot 15 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 15 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b>  Poor design. Inappropriate for location. Detrimental impact on surrounding area.  Contrary to GD1
3317	PA18/04271	New Residential Units Plot 16 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for appearance and landscaping for Unit 16 following outline approval PA14/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyahn Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	Application supported.
3301	PA18/04370	Land adj to Number 15, Trelawney Road, St Ives <i>(Mr G Becconsall)</i>	Proposed construction of a pair of semi-detached dwellings	Objection.  Overdevelopment. Contrary to NDP policies GD1, BE17 and T2.
3303	PA18/01319	Shoreline, 30A Trelawney Avenue, St Ives <i>(Dr Lucas McGrath)</i>	Driveway to side of house	No objection.
3304	PA18/03941	1 Carbis Mews, Boskerris Road, Carbis Bay <i>(Carolyn Hendra)</i>	Single storey extension to dwelling	Application supported.
3305	PA18/04090	6 Tregenna Hill, St Ives <i>(Mr M De Rozarieux)</i>	Creation of a new entrance within ground floor shop front to serve first floor flat and proposed alterations to the rear elevation of the flat	Application supported but upper window could be better designed (glazing bar needed as with existing window)
3320	PA18/04389	Porthgwidden Beach Café, Porthgwidden, St Ives	Proposed canopy structure over existing outside seating area.	Application supported.



Planning Committee

21 June 2018

		<i>(Porthgwidden Beach Café)</i>		
3321	PA18/04554	2 Dove Street, St Ives <i>(Carnell Wrekin Window)</i>	Replacement of existing timber windows with PVC, like for like.	Objection. Windows should be wood.
3322	PA18/04759	5 Carrack Dhu Estate, St Ives <i>(Mr Mansfield)</i>	Construction of gate into the driveway with associated railings.	Objection. Out of keeping. Will change the character of the area/estate.
3324	PA18/04202	Land NNE of 2 Penbeagle Close, St Ives <i>(Mr and Mrs Frith)</i>	New dwelling and associated works including access drive	Application supported.
3326	PA18/05059	Bryn Teg, Headland Road, Carbis Bay <i>(Mr and Mrs Goulder)</i>	Two storey rear extension, single storey side extension, re-open side window, attic conversion with dormer.	Objection. Overdevelopment. Substantial increase of footprint. Out of keeping with area. Contrary to NDP BE12.
3327	PA18/04711	3 St Johns Walk, St Ives <i>(Mr P Salt)</i>	Demolition of extension, construction of two flats and associated works.	<b>Strongest possible objection. Request to be called to committee should the planning officer be minded to approve application.</b>  Out of character and overdevelopment.  Contrary to GD1
3328	PA18/04991	Roseleigh, Bungalow, Towednack, St Ives <i>(Mr P Sanger)</i>	Rear construction to bungalow and additional rooflights to rear elevation	Application supported.
3329	PA18/04972	Greenfields, Belyars Lane, The Belyars, St Ives <i>(Mr &amp; Mrs Skitt)</i>	Proposed first floor extension with terrace	Application supported.
3330	PA18/04902	Penayr, 5 Draycott Terrace, St Ives <i>(Mr &amp; Mrs Adamson)</i>	Dorner and kitchen extension with terrace	Re-submission requested. Unable to make decision as no plans available to view.
3331	PA18/04447	Blackbird Studio, Steeple Lane, St Ives <i>(Ms Murray)</i>	Construction of chalet-style dwelling adjacent to blackbird studio	Councillor Lait withdrew from the meeting during discussions – as a friend of the applicant.  Objection. Overdevelopment. Contrary to NDP 0S6.

**Planning Committee**

**21 June 2018**

3332	PA18/ 05495	Cubit Lodge, Access Track to Trevethoe from St Ives Road, Trevethoe Lelant ( <i>Mr &amp; Mrs Dean</i> )	T1 – Ash- remove lowest branch and T2 Scotts Pine fell and replant	Councillor Symons withdrew from the meeting during discussions – as a close neighbour to the applicant.  Application supported provided Tree Officer approves.
3333	PA18/ 04388	5 The Meadow, St Ives ( <i>Mr P Stanyer</i> )	Widened access to existing balcony	Application supported on the condition that the door is wooden rather than plastic.
3334	PA18/04 263	Tregenna castle Hotel, Tregenna Castle, St Ives ( <i>Tregenna Castle Hotel</i> )	Removal of existing access road, construction of new residential lodge and introduction of new landscaping	Objection to the construction of a new residential lodge. Support blocking up road/access route.  Contravenes NDP OS6. Will set a dangerous precedent.  Too close and too visible from the main road.  Detrimental to green corridor.
3335	PA18/ 04838	Treventon, Burthallan Lane, St Ives ( <i>Mr D Jacques</i> )	The proposal is for the refurbishment and roof extension to the dwelling Treventon in St Ives. Footprint, access, gardens and parking will stay as existing	Objection. Overdevelopment, unneighbourly and overbearing.  Contrary to NDP GD1 and BE10
3336	PA18/ 05527	Uplands, Higher Stennack, St Ives ( <i>Mr Pickard</i> )	Single-storey rear extension, replacement detached garage with home office over	Objection. Overdevelopment. Unneighbourly and overbearing.  Contrary to GD1
3337	PA18/ 05010	8 Carbis Bay Holiday Park, Laity Lane, Carbis Bay, St Ives ( <i>Mrs Claire Mason</i> )	Removal of condition 6 of 1/85/P/1253/O to allow year round occupancy	Application supported – providing H2 policy adhered to (in agreement with Planning Officer's comments).
3338	PA18/ 05069	Bussow Farm, Swallows Barn, Towednack Road, St Ives	Proposed one bedroom annexe accommodation	Application supported as long as property remains in ownership of house and such uses as Airbnb are not permitted.

**Planning Committee**

**21 June 2018**

		(Mr G Thomas)		
3339	PA18/ 05357	Chimneys, 5 Porthmeor Square, St Ives (Mr & Mrs S Popat)	Alteration of roof above front section of lounge to increase headroom	No objection providing Conservation Officer approves.
3340	PA18/ 03560	Rosevanion, St Ives (Mrs Duff-Tytler)	Proposed rear extension, terracing to garden.	Application supported provided not unneighbourly.