

Minutes of the Meeting of the Planning Committee, St Ives Town Council held in the Council Chamber, The Guildhall, St Ives on Thursday 25 May 2018 at 7.00pm.

PRESENT

Chairman – Councillor J Symons
Vice Chairman – Councillor R Lait
COUNCILLORS

Glanville R	Mitchell A
Griffin J	Tanner J
Lait R	Williams T
Messenger K	

OFFICERS

Administrative Assistant
Facilities Manager/Acting Supports Services Manager

APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillor S Tanner, Councillor C Nicholls and Councillor R Henry

P.137 APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRMAN AND VICE-CHAIRMAN

RESOLVED – that Councillor Joan Symons be elected as Chairman of the Planning Committee and for Councillor Rita Lait to be elected as Vice-Chairman

P.138 MINUTES

RESOLVED – that the Chairman signs as a true and correct record the Minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 26 April 2018.

P.139 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Item No. 3284 PA18/03905 – Former Monowai Hotel, Headland Road, Carbis Bay

Councillor Williams declared an interest as a friend of the architect and withdrew from the meeting during discussion of this item.

Item No. 3272 PA18/03481 – Land adj to Barallan, Burthallan Lane, St Ives

Councillor Messenger declared an interest as a friend of the applicant and withdrew from the meeting during discussion of this item.

P.140 PUBLIC SPEAKING

- (1) PA18/03905 – Former Monowai Hotel, Headland Road, Carbis Bay
One speaker objecting to the application.
- (2) PA18/03534 – Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives
One speaker in support of the application.
- (3) PA18/04383 – Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives
One speaker objecting to the application.
- (4) PA18/04094 and further applications relating to Plots 1-16 at Treloyhan Manor, St Ives.
One speaker in support of the application and one speaker objecting to the application.

P.141 PLANNING APPLICATIONS

RESOLVED - that the Head of Development Management (Cornwall Council) be informed of the Council's observations on the planning applications set out in Annex 1 to these minutes.

P.142 **NEIGHBOURHOOD DEVELOPMENT PLAN REVIEW GROUP
UPDATES AND ITEMS FOR DECISION**

(1) Twelve Month Review – Neighbourhood Development Plan 2015-2030

Neighbourhood Development Plan Officer, Lucy Davies, apologised for being unable to attend the meeting.

Councillors were circulated a copy of the NDP Twelve-Month Review prior to the Planning Committee meeting, enabling all to have an opportunity to familiarise themselves with the content. Councillor Lait explained that she will be willing to meet with any Councillors who wished for clarification on the content of the Review and Councillors were advised to contact her if they had any concerns.

RECOMMENDED – that the Neighbourhood Development Plan Twelve Month Review is approved and adopted at the next meeting of full Council.

(2) Action Plan – items for update/decision

No update.

P.143 **PA18/01007 – Carbis Bay Hotel, Beach Road, Carbis Bay**

A response is requested, in the form of a letter to RAIID, after the Town Council received correspondence from the National Trust expressing concerns that the proposed development of the new spa building and 3 No.3-bedroom holiday lodges is likely to *'harm the distinctive coastal landscape and seascape qualities of what remains of the undeveloped headland, extending development into the undeveloped coast, forward to the South West Coastal Path, and bringing it nearer to the Trust's land.'*

RESOLVED – that the Acting Support Services Manager write a letter to RAIID and to the National Trust stating the Town Council's observations in relation to PA18/01007 – Carbis Bay Hotel, Beach Road, Carbis Bay.

P.144 **ST IVES PLANNING APPLICATIONS TO BE DETERMINED BY CORNWALL COUNCIL –
WEST SUB- AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE**

None.

P.145 **CORRESPONDENCE**

Correspondence relating to planning applications had been circulated and available to councillors during consideration of the applications.

Meeting closed at 9.02 pm

Chairman

St Ives Town Council
 Planning Schedule for meeting date 24 May 2018

Ref No.	CC Ref	Site (Applicant)	Proposal	
3284	PA18/03905	Former Monowai Hotel, Headland Road, Carbis Bay (Mr D Symonds)	Non-material amendment (No.6) for change of paving finish to car park area concrete pavers – Marshalls Brindle or equal to (PA16/00999) Demolition of existing building and replacement by residential block of 6 apartments including car parking, landscaping and associated works.	<p>Councillor Williams declared an interest in this item and withdrew from the meeting during discussions.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection.</p> <p>Refusal on grounds of the sheer cumulative amount of non-material amendments on site</p> <p>Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval</p>
3275	PA18/03534	Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives (Mr Kevin Mantle – Christian Guild)	Reserved matters application for the construction of 5 self-catering units, including landscaping and construction of conservatory to Manor (details following outline PA14/00811 dated 07/05/15)	<p>Strongest possible objection.</p> <p>Inappropriate for site. Style and massing will seriously detract from Manor House. Too intrusive. Concerns over the size of the conservatory.</p> <p>Request to be called to committee if the Planning Officer recommendation is for approval</p>
3286	PA18/04384	Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives (Mr Shaun Fox Vulpes Ltd)	Works to trees subject to a tree preservation order. Light clearance pruning of Monterey Pine, Beech, Sugar Maple/Acacia, Copper Beech, Lime and Turkey Oak trees to 5.2 metres above driveway	<p>Strongest possible objection</p> <p>Question the necessity of the works. Contrary to NDP OS3.</p> <p>Request to be called to committee if the Planning Officer recommendation is for</p>

				approval
3287	PA18/04094	New Residential Units, Plot 1, Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 1 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is in same style as & only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee.</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3288	PA18/04155	New Residential Units, Plot 1 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 1 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is similar to PA18/04094. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision made on 29 March.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee.</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3292	PA18/04156	New Residential Units, Plot 2 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 2 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including	<p>Proposed design is similar to PA18/04097. Style is inappropriate for the setting. Adhere to previous decision made on 29 March.</p>

			extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee.</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3298	PA18/04258	New Residential Units, Plot 2 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 2 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is stone clad and completely different to three previous applications for this plot. None of the other Treloyhan applications on the agenda are of this design.</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3300	PA18/04097	New Residential Units, Plot 2 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 2 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Initially adhere to previous decisions for all plots Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee – observations from Planning Committee meeting held 29 March 2018</p> <p>After discussions, it was decided that full re-submission for Plots 1-16 will be necessary. Request for re-call and full re-submission – so that an informed decision can be made on up-to-date plans.</p>
3299	PA18/04098	New Residential Units, Plot 3 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 3 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including	<p>Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to</p>

			extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>previous decision.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee.</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3291	PA18/04166	New Residential Units, Plot 3 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 3 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is similar to PA18/04098. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision made on 29 March.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee.</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3290	PA18/04157	New Residential Units, Plot 9 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 9 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee,</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for</p>

				re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs .
3289	PA18/04167	New Residential Units, Plot 10 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 10 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision. Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee, As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs .
3293	PA18/04171	New Residential Units, Plot 11 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 11 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision. Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee, As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs .
3302	PA18/04172	New Residential Units, Plot 12 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 12 following outline	Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which

		Avenue, St Ives (<i>Christian Guild Holidays</i>)	approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision. Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee, As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs .
3295	PA18/04168	New Residential Units, Plot 13 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives (<i>Christian Guild Holidays</i>)	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 13 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision. Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee. As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs .
3294	PA18/04169	New Residential Units, Plot 14 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives (<i>Christian Guild Holidays</i>)	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 14 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision. Strongest possible objection and request to

				<p>be called to committee,</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3296	PA18/04173	New Residential Units, Plot 15 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 15 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee,</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs.</p>
3297	PA18/04170	New Residential Units, Plot 16 Treloyhan Manor, Treloyan Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Reserved matters application for Appearance and Landscaping for Unit 16 following outline approval PA18/00811 dated 07.05.15 for restoration of Treloyhan Manor Hotel including extension to hotel, 5 self-catering units and enabling residential development for 16 plots in hotel grounds	<p>Proposed design is in the same style as and only slightly changed from application which committee strongly objected to on 29 March. Style is inappropriate for setting. Adhere to previous decision.</p> <p>Strongest possible objection and request to be called to committee,</p> <p>As 3 different sets of applications for the 16 plots were validated on consecutive days, request for re-call and re-submission for clarification so that</p>

				an informed decision can be made on the up-to-date designs .
3270	PA18/03521	13 Victoria Road, St Ives <i>(Mrs Gill Prisk)</i>	Replacement windows and doors to front and rear elevations	Application supported providing Conservation Officer approves.
3271	PA17/08067	Trowan Framhouse. Trowan Lane, St Ives <i>(Mr Philip Bradby)</i>	Construction of a 15.700m x 7.900 (51' x 25'11") timber frame timber clad agricultural implement shed for on farm agricultural use, beneath a dual pitch roof clad in profile steel sheeting.	Application supported.
3272	PA18/03481	Land adj to Barallan, Burthallan Lane, St Ives <i>(Mr M Kilby)</i>	Construction of 2 dwelling houses and associated works.	Councillor Messenger declared an interest in this item as a friend of the applicant and withdrew from the meeting during discussion. Strongest possible objection. Adverse impact on whole area. Should be low and discrete. Excessive amount of glazing. Overbearing impact in a sensitive area. Local member will call to committee should the Planning Officer recommend approval.
3273	PA18/03871	58 Trelawney Avenue, St Ives <i>(Mr & Mrs O Skinner)</i>	Conversion and extension of loft including rooflight to front and dormer to rear.	Strongest possible objection. Excessively large. Out of keeping in the local area. Overdevelopment and unneighbourly. Request to be called to committee should the Planning Officer recommend approval.
3274	PA18/03804	9 Little In Sight, St Ives <i>(Ms Y Phillips)</i>	Rear 2 storey extension.	No objection providing not unneighbourly
3276	PA18/03849	45 Porthia Road, St Ives <i>(Mr Sean Farrell)</i>	Proposed ground floor bedroom and shower room extension for disabled access	No objection providing not unneighbourly

3277	PA18/03999	Fairings, Hellesvean, St Ives (<i>Mr and Mrs Martin and Trudie Austin</i>)	Monterey Cypress trees 1,2,3 and 4. Remove and replant with 4 English Oak Trees	Objection. Oaks are an inappropriate replacement for the Cypress Trees.
3278	PA18/03751	The Cottage Hotel, Boskerris Road, Carbis Bay (<i>Bellward Properties Ltd</i>)	Variation of condition 2 (approved plans condition) in respect of decision PA16/10452 (Demolition of the Cottage hotel and new construction of 30 no. Over 55's 1 and 2 bedroomed apartments and 7 no. open market duplex apartments and diversion of public right of way number 75) to allow alterations and approved layout.	Application supported as per Planning Officer's comments.
3279	PA18/03738	Meadowlands, The Saltings, Lelant (<i>Miss Sophie Combarel</i>)	Reduction or felling to save cabbage palm	Inadequate information provided. Should try to save tree if possible.
3280	PA18/02672	Tremeadow, Tremar Road, St Ives (<i>Mr Simon Jeffs</i>)	Retrospective application for the relocation of existing car port, repair and replacement timber roof supports, poly carbonate roof and wooden gates. Render existing garden wall and front garden to roadside property boundary wall	Application supported.
3281	PA18/04182	27 Richmond Way, Carbis Bay (<i>Mr Brindley</i>)	Proposal Proposed lower floor extension to form garage with terrace above	Application supported provided not unneighbourly.
3282	PA18/01704	19 Penwith Road, St Ives (<i>Mrs V Marks</i>)	Erection of a dwelling	Application supported. NDP H2 Policy should be applied.
3283	PA18/04333	3 Harrys Court, Back Road, West St Ives (<i>Mr Paul Semple</i>)	Listed building consent application to re-render/mortar South Western (road facing) elevation.	Application supported provided Conservation Officer approves and providing no loss of granite wall/stonework/facing etc.

Planning Committee

24 May 2018

3285	PA18/04 481	7 Halsetown, Cornwall (<i>Mr P Savage</i>)	Removal of external concrete stair and replace door with window at first floor. Rear extension and replace aluminium windows with traditional sash PVC – U windows and new door.	Application supported provided Conservation Officer approves.
------	----------------	---	--	---