

Minutes of the Meeting of the Planning Committee, St Ives Town Council held in the Council Chamber, The Guildhall, St Ives on Thursday 29 March 2018 at 7pm.

PRESENT

Chairman – Councillor J Symons
Vice Chairman – Councillor Lait R

COUNCILLORS

Andrewes T
Garrod H
Griffin J
Nicholls C

Mitchell A Arrived 7.55pm
Tanner J
Tanner S
Williams T

OFFICERS

Administrative Assistant

APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillor Glanville and Councillor Henry.

P.114 MINUTES

RESOLVED – that the Chairman signs as a true and correct record the Minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 8 March 2018.

P.115 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Item No. 3223 – PA18/2029 Former Monowai Hotel, Headland Road, Carbis Bay
Councillor Williams declared an interest as a friend of the Architect and withdrew from the meeting during consideration of this item.
Councillor Nicholls declared an interest for personal matters and withdrew from the meeting during consideration of this item.

P.116 PUBLIC SPEAKING

- Item No. 3245 – PA18/02327 Land West of Menhyr Drive, Menhyr Drive, Carbis Bay
1 Speaker in support of the application.
- Item No. 3224 – PA18/02029 – Former Monowai Hotel, Headland Road, Carbis Bay
1 Speaker objecting to the application.
- Item Nos. 3231-3242 – New Residential Units, Plots 1-16 Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives
1 Speaker objecting to the applications
- Item No. 3230 – Keepers Rock, Higher Tregenna Road, St Ives
1 Speaker objecting to the application
- Item No. 3224 – PA18/01885 – Land adjacent to 4 Atlantic Lookout, Atlantic Lookout, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives
1 Speaker in support of the application

P.117 PLANNING APPLICATIONS

RESOLVED- that the Head of Development Management (Cornwall Council) be informed of the Council's observations on the planning applications set out in Annex 1 to these minutes.

P.118 NEIGHBOURHOOD DEVELOPMENT PLAN REVIEW GROUP
UPDATES AND ITEMS FOR DECISION

The first year review of the Neighbourhood Development Plan is currently being written. The Action Plan has taken a back seat, whilst the review's construction has taken priority.

RESOLVED – Councillor Lait will provide an update at the next meeting of the Planning Committee on Thursday 26 April 2018.

P.119 ST IVES PLANNING APPLICATIONS TO BE DETERMINED BY CORNWALL COUNCIL –
WEST SUB- AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

None.

P.120 CORRESPONDENCE

Correspondence relating to planning applications had been circulated and available to councillors during consideration of the applications.

Meting closed at 8.30pm

Chairman

St Ives Town Council
 Planning Schedule for meeting date 29 March 2018

Ref No.	CC Ref	Site (Applicant)	Proposal	Observations
3243	PA18/02327	Land West Of Menhyr Drive, Menhyr Drive, Carbis Bay <i>(Mr and Mrs Johnson)</i>	Variation of condition 2 (approved plans) in respect of decision PA15/11893 dated 10.10.16 for residential development of 14 affordable homes and 20 open market homes, including access road and open space provision.	Application supported. Respectful design with Cornish hedges. Road layout accessed from either ends. Positive use of open green space. H2 Policy adhered to. High proportion of affordable housing. Encouraging potential for self builds.
3223	PA18/02029	Former Monowai Hotel, Headland Road, Carbis Bay <i>(Mr David Symons)</i>	Non-material amendment (No. 5) for 1. Change of paving finish to car park area to concrete pavers - Marshalls Brindle or equal, 2. Addition of stainless steel flue for a wood burning stove to roof at NW corner, 3. Addition of digital and satellite aerials to east elevation of Entrance block to PA16/00999; (Demolition of existing building and replacement by residential block of 6 apartments including car parking, landscaping and associated works), to allow for 2 2nd floor kitchen windows in the east elevation of apartment 5 to be omitted to PA16/00999; (Demolition of existing building and replacement by residential block of 6 apartments including car parking, landscaping and associated works), to allow for 2 2nd floor kitchen windows in the east elevation of apartment 5 to be omitted.	Adhere to previous strongest possible objection. Changes are more than non-material amendments. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval Councillor Williams and Councillor Nicholls withdrew from the meeting during discussion of this application.
3231	PA18/02143	New Residential Units, Plot 1, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 1 (Appearance and Landscaping	Plot 1 Detrimental impact on access route into St Ives. Intensity of development goes against the original spirit of the application.

		<p>Holidays)</p>	<p>Proposed design bears no relation to the character of the woodland. Excessive use of glazing. Concern over protection of trees left standing.</p> <p>Inappropriate use of materials i.e. blackened timber composite boarding and powder coated aluminium. Design is contrary to original Design and Access Statement. Wholly inappropriate design is an insult to one of St Ives' major heritage assets, namely Treloyhan Manor. There has been no respect for the existing building. Development is totally contrary to anything in the vicinity.</p> <p>Footprint of dwelling is larger than initially proposed. Should be a new application due to this increase.</p> <p>The plot area now extends to include the part of the proposed buffer zone and area to be maintained for biodiversity enhancement as identified in the Landscape Management Plan (itself a condition of the outline consent). In particular, this extension of the plot contravenes Objective 6 in the Landscape Management Plan: 'Introduce a perimeter landscape buffer to be retained by the Treloyhan Manor Hotel with enhanced planting'. The private garden of this plot would also incorporate the existing footpath, which is not shown on new plan- All contrary to approved outlined consent.</p> <p>Proposed dwelling is contrary to NDP Policies GD1, CH1, OS3, OS6 & BE6</p> <p>Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval</p> <p>Councillor Mitchell did not vote on this application as he wasn't present for the debate.</p>
--	--	------------------	---

3232	PA18/02144	New Residential Units, Plot 2, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 2 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Contravenes all various policies. Objection for same reasons as Plot 1. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3233	PA18/02145	New Residential Units, Plot 3, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 3 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Contravenes all various policies. Objection for same reasons as Plots 1 & 2. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3234	PA18/02146	New Residential Units, Plots 4-8, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Units 4-8 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Detrimental to character of the original hotel. Will overshadow and detract from main building. Style totally out of keeping. Height, massing and bulk wholly inappropriate for surroundings. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3235	PA18/02149	New Residential Units, Plot 9, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 9 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Please refer to objections for Plots 1-3 in terms of poor design, detrimental to views from Hain Walk, absence of perimeter buffer zone. The side elevations, with extensive polymer-coated aluminium panels, will be particularly prominent from public views on Hain Walk and will have a detrimental impact on the streetscene. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval

3236	PA18/02150	New Residential Units, Plot 10, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No.PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 10 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Incongruous design. Objection for the same reasons as Plot 1. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Additional issues with Plots 10-12. In outline consent, these properties had pitched roofs. They now have balconies and high flat roofs – making them unneighbourly and overlooking. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3237	PA18/02151	New Residential Units, Plot 11, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No.PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 11 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Objection for same reasons as Plot 1. Excessive use of glazing. Overlooking and unneighbourly. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3238	PA18/02152	New Residential Units, Plot 12, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 12 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Objection for same reasons as Plot 1. Excessive use of glazing. Overlooking and unneighbourly. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Please note that plots 13-16 are all subject to a guillotine clause in the S106 agreement for the Outline Consent. As such, any detailed permission will not be able to be built out unless or until the terms of the clause have been met, and thus any consent for these applications should also explicitly be conditional on the terms of guillotine. Request to be called to committee if the officer

				recommendation is for approval
3239	PA18/02153	New Residential Units, Plot 13, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 13 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection Design inappropriate Detrimental impact on the surrounding area. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Guillotine clause: see above. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3240	PA18/02154	New Residential Units, Plot 14, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 14 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection on the same grounds as with Plot 13. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Guillotine clause: see above. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3241	PA18/02155	New Residential Units, Plot 15, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 15 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection on the same grounds as with Plot 14. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. Guillotine clause: see above. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3242	PA18/02156	New Residential Units, Plot 16, Treloyhan Manor, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives <i>(Christian Guild Holidays)</i>	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 16 (Appearance and Landscaping)	Strongest Possible Objection. Contravenes all the NDP policies previously referred to. The poor design and materials of the south-east elevation is particularly unfortunate in this prominent entry point to the new development. Unneighbourly and overlooking. Guillotine clause: see above. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3230	PA18/02312	Keepers Rock, Higher Tregenna	Proposed annexe	Objection. Unneighbourly. High and

		Road, St Ives (<i>Mr P Dudley</i>)		overlooking. Against the character of the area. Serious infill in plot. Contrary to NDP BE6 and GD1.
3224	PA18/01885	Land Adj to 4 Atlantic Lookout, Atlantic Lookout, Trelyon Avenue, St Ives (<i>Philip Cole</i>)	Proposed dwelling	Application supported.
3220	PA18/01762	Riviera Apartments, Boskerris Road, Carbis Bay, St Ives (<i>Mrs Jane Moxon Riviera Apartments Ltd</i>)	Various tree works including 20% crown thin of Sycamore T4 and 10% crown thin of G1	Support in line with Tree Officer.
3221	PA18/02022	Ven Ayr, Fore Street, Lelant (<i>Mr Richard Boon</i>)	Remove and replace T1 and T2 Monterey Cypress trees with 2 x standard English Oaks	Support in line with Tree Officer.
3222	PA18/02005	Pendennis, Bishops Road, St Ives (<i>Mrs B Graham</i>)	Two -storey extension, replacement roof (raising ridge height) with flat roof dormers and rooflights (dormer loft conversion). Alterations to driveway and associated works	Strongest Possible Objection. Unacceptable loss of character. Taking away pitched gables and replacing with solid roof. Unneighbourly. Detrimental impact on view from town. Objection to knocking down Cornish hedge (this has been actioned already). Impact on local heritage assets. Contrary to NDP CH1, BE11 and OS9. Totally misleading application. Massive size and bulk with no character. Request to be called to committee if the officer recommendation is for approval
3225	PA17/12152	Carbis Bay Hotel, Beach Road, Carbis Bay, (<i>Mr Stephen Baker</i>)	Single storey building and associated landscaping works to contain combined heat and power units, western power transformer, hot water systems and electrical control systems for the hotel complex	Objection Disproportionately large structure. Detrimental impact on entrance to Carbis Bay Valley. Loss of parking. Contrary to NDP OS1 and T3. Adverse effect on the setting.
3226	PA18/02470	1 Rose Cottage, Fore Street, Lelant (<i>Mrs M Walton</i>)	Listed Building Consent to replace/repair existing roof	No objection.
3228	PA18/02097	Former Stone Masons Workshop,	Outline application with all matters reserved for demolition	Application supported – providing application adheres to NDP GD1,

		Clodgy View, St Ives (<i>Mr D and T Pascoe</i>)	of existing outbuildings, construction of residential dwelling and associated works	BE5 and Policy H2.
3229	PA18/ 01246	Unit 2, Penbeagle Industrial Estate, St Ives (<i>Ms Andrea Spencer- Smith Matthew Stevens & Son Ltd</i>)	Proposed industrial unit designed to house a processing area and chiller for seafood products	Application supported.