

Minutes of the Meeting of the Planning Committee, St Ives Town Council held in the Council Chamber, The Guildhall, St Ives on Thursday 23rd May 2019 at 7.00pm.

PRESENT

Chairman – Councillor R Lait
Vice-Chairman – Councillor Messenger

COUNCILLORS

Mitchell A	Nicholls C
Burton P	Tanner J
Griffin J	Tanner S
Harris T	Williams T

IN ATTENDANCE

Glanville R

OFFICERS

Supports Services Manager Administrative Assistant

APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors J Symons and R Henry.

P.1 MINUTES

RESOLVED – that the Chairman signs as a true and correct record the Minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 25th April 2019.

P.2 APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

RESOLVED – that Councillor Lait be appointed as Chair of the Planning Committee.

P.3 APPOINTMENT OF VICE CHAIR OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

RESOLVED – that Councillor Messenger be appointed as Vice-Chair of the Planning Committee.

P.4 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

- Councillor Tanner declared an interest in PA19/03281 for professional reasons.
- Councillor Harris declared an interest in PA19/02179 as a friend of the applicant.

P.5 PUBLIC SPEAKING

- PA19/03040 – Land West of Menhyr Drive, Menhyr Drive, Carbis Bay

Statement read out on behalf of speaker (in support of the application) - who was unable to attend.

Planning Committee
23 May 2019

- PA19/02818 – Little Hendra, Boskerris Road, Carbis Bay

One speaker objecting to the application.

- PA19/03441 – Upland Higher Stennack, St Ives

One speaker in support of the application.

P.6 PLANNING APPLICATIONS

RESOLVED - that the Head of Development Management (Cornwall Council) be informed of the Council's observations on the planning applications set out in Annex 1 to these minutes.

P.7 NEIGHBOURHOOD DEVELOPMENT PLAN AND ACTION PLAN – UPDATE

No update at this stage.

P.8 ST IVES PLANNING APPLICATIONS TO BE DETERMINED BY CORNWALL COUNCIL – WEST SUB-AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

None.

Meeting closed at 9.06 pm

Chairman

St Ives Town Council
 Planning Schedule for meeting dated 23 May 2019

Item	CC Ref	Address	Proposals	Observations
3593	PA19/03040	Land West Of Menhyr Drive Menhyr Drive Carbis Bay	Residential development of 14 Affordable Homes and 20 Open Market Homes, including Access Road and Open Space Provision without compliance with Condition 2 (approved plans) of Decision Notice PA15/11893 dated 25th September 2018.	Application supported.
3596	PA19/02818	Little Hendra, Boskerris Road, Carbis Bay (St Clements Hill Ltd)	Demolition of existing dwelling and redevelopment of the site to provide 5no. new dwelling and 1no. replacement dwelling.	<p>Objection. Request to be called to committee should Case Officer be minded to approve.</p> <p>We are disappointed that the applicant hasn't listened to any of the local comments and concerns and the general principles and layout have changed little from the previous scheme which was refused. The total floor area of the scheme is relatively unchanged and there are no significant height reductions.</p> <p>We do not believe that the original reasons for refusal have been addressed and feel strongly, given that the policies in the St Ives NDP provide clear guidance in such cases. The overall layout, density and scale of the development is unacceptable and not sensitive to the surroundings or neighbouring properties. It doesn't integrate successfully with the surrounding context and would be detrimental to the character of the area. Through over development and extensive hard landscaping it doesn't comply with BE17 which requires that development in existing private gardens provides usable amenity space. Neither does it protect important vistas and views, especially from Hain Walk and Headland Road. It is therefore in conflict with policies GD1, BE12 and BE17 of the St Ives Area Neighbourhood</p>

				Development Plan. Councillor Glanville left the meeting after voting (7.35pm).
3594	PA19/03441	Uplands, Higher Stennack, St Ives (Mr Pickard)	Regularisation of the partly constructed replacement detached garage with home office over – with variation of condition 2 to previously approved planning permission PA18/05527, dated 22.08.2018.	Objection. We note the previous planning history and attempts to introduce a two storey house onto the plot. Whilst the ground has been lowered to reduce the height, the applicant has also increased the roof height. The increased size of the building which has been carried out contrary to the approved plans, and will result in over development of the site and is unneighbourly. Contrary to GD1 & BE10. Councillor Mitchell abstained from voting, due to his links with enforcement regarding this property.
3595	PA19/03243	Land adj to 36 Menhyr Drive, Carbis Bay (Mr & Mrs Lagor)	Construction of a new semi-detached self-build dwelling with variation of condition 4 on Decision Notice No. PA18/10223 dated 21/12/2018.	Unable to support The town council are unable to support or comment in detail on this proposal. The consultation documents lack good quality clear plans and the absence of any comments from the case officer mean it is not possible to comment further.
3597	PA19/02869	Porthgwidden Beach Café, Porthgwidden, St Ives (Mrs D Smith Porthgwidden Beach Café)	Café/restaurant to hold civil ceremonies (20 weddings per year).	Application supported.
3598	PA19/03294	3 Menhyr Drive, Carbis Bay, St Ives (Mr & Mrs Creedon)	Proposed two storey side extension and replacement garage.	No objection.
3599	PA19/03281	Saints Funeral Services, Park Avenue, St Ives (Mrs A Slattery)	Change of use as a funeral director's office, mortuary and chapel of rest to B1 offices.	Councillor S Tanner declared an interest in this item and withdrew from the meeting during discussions. Application supported.
3600	PA19/03440	Tresillian House, St Ives Road, Carbis Bay	Conservatory to front elevation.	Councillor S Tanner not present for the vote. Application supported.

		(Mr Dennis Taylor)		
3601	PA19/ 03622	5 Beach Road, St Ives (Mr and Mrs O Akkerman)	Ground floor rear extension with terrace over and roof terrace in front roof slope.	Councillor Tanner not present for the vote. Application supported.
3602	PA19/ 03346	St Ives Harbour Hotel, The Terrace, St Ives (Mr David Evans Harbour Hotels)	New entrance porch.	Application supported.
3603	PA19/ 02179	Talisman, Strawberry Lane, Lelant, St Ives (Mrs Gwyneth Hampson)	Construction of an ancillary annexe.	Councillor Harris declared an interest in this item and withdrew from the meeting during discussions. Application supported, provided not unneighbourly.
3604	PA19/ 02637	Pendennis, Bishops Road, St Ives (Mr Graham)	Alterations and extensions to include terrace/balcony.	Objection. The Council are concerned that the modifications proposed to this dwelling are excessive in scale and mass and are therefore detrimental to the character of the building and are out of keeping with the surrounding area. The re-designed dwelling would be in conflict with GD1 and OS9 and also the NDP character area policy BE11 (a) . The Council are also concerned with the poor quality of the plans when viewed on line which make the proposed changes difficult to interpret.
3605	PA19/ 03809	Former St Margarets Hotel, St Ives Road, Carbis Bay (Marconi Builders)	Works to trees covered by a Tree Preservation Order.	Application supported, providing planting monitored closely and subject to Tree Officer's approval.

3606	PA19/ 03727	Kyra, Dynas Ia Road, The Belyars, St Ives (Mr D Townley)	Small rear garden extension, replacement balcony with privacy screen, relocation of entrance and new entrance porch and utility.	No objection.
3607	PA19/ 03356	Land Off Tyingham Road, Tyingham Road, Lelant (Mr A Edwards)	Application for approval of reserved matters following outline approval PA11/02199 for development of land for 15no. dwellings including access road and associated works with variation of condition 1 in relation to PA15/04253.	No objection.
3608	PA19/ 03485	Pentreath, Bishops Road, St Ives (Mr Reynolds)	Proposed rear extension	Application supported.
3609	PA19/ 00056	Endsleigh, St Ives Road, Carbis Bay (Mr A Price)	Application for a non-material amendment in respect of decision notice W1/09-1226 (demolition of hotel, construction of 6 self-contained units and associated works)	Objection. The Town Council have previously expressed concern in relation to numerous aspects of this permitted scheme. We accept that our comments are sought in relation to a minor change to window and entrance treatments which would ordinarily be an acceptable NMA. However, we feel we must take this opportunity to urge the Planning Authority to address the very glaring inconsistencies between the consented scheme and approved plans and what has been built upon the site. A recent NMA application was withdrawn because it sought approval for a minor amendment to a design which has not actually been built and in particular, the dormer windows. In addition, the original approved plans show that the completed development would be finished in stone. This is in keeping with the original Endsleigh building. However, a pre commencement condition for the materials to be submitted and approved was never complied with. Now there is a rendered finish. We want to take the opportunity to express our disquiet about the way in which the applicant has departed from the consented development. We would firmly request that the planning

				authority review the NMA application within the overall context of the consented scheme and compare it to what has been built. We would like the LPA to approve the materials and for the proposed stone finish to be re-instated. We would like the applicant to be required to regularise the development in full and, failing that for enforcement action to be pursued.
3610	PA19/03681	Mermaid Cottage, 4 Virgin Street, St Ives (Ms H Jones)	Replacement of slates to front elevation of roof.	Application supported.
3611	PA19/03682	Mermaid Cottage, 4 Virgin Street, St Ives (Ms H Jones)	Listed building consent for replacement of slates to front elevation of roof.	Application supported.
3612	PA19/03181	15 Fore Street, St Ives (Mr Geraint Thomas – White Stuff Ltd)	Retrospective permission for existing shopfront to be redecorated.	Application supported, providing the conservation officer is in support.
3613	PA19/03493	Godrevy, Beach Road, Carbis Bay (Mr S Baker)	Application for discharge of a planning obligation in respect of decision notice 98/08/0108/F dated 16/09/2018	<p>We are concerned that this request creates a precedent for other holiday properties in beachside locations. We would request that the Planning Authority determine the request in line with the chief planning officer’s advice note on lifting holiday conditions.</p> <p>If the LPA are minded to lift the condition, we note that the permitted scheme was granted under previous Penwith DC policies which had an affordable housing site threshold of two dwellings and that in having a holiday occupancy restriction is it likely that the planning authority forwent important community obligations at the time. We would therefore request that any lifting should require the applicant to make any appropriate financial contributions towards community benefits as is set out in the advice note.</p>