

Minutes of the Meeting of the Planning Committee, St Ives Town Council held on Thursday 11<sup>th</sup> November 2021 at 7.00pm.

PRESENT

Chairman – Councillor K Messenger  
Vice-Chairman – Councillor A Mitchell

COUNCILLORS

Beveridge J  
Hynes S

Ryall J  
Wells J

OFFICERS

Town Clerk  
Digital Marketing Apprentice

P.118 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillor S Tanner and Councillor Rogers

P.119 CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Chairman notified the Committee that Councillor Lisa Arthur had tendered her resignation from the Committee. This would be reported back to Council to request an additional committee member.

The Chairman welcomed the Council's newly appointed digital marketing apprentice to the meeting.

P.120 PUBLIC SPEAKING

Item No 4170 - PA21/09320 – Sand Dune House Headland Road Carbis Bay

One speaker spoke in support of the application

Item No. 4191 and 4192 – PA21/10337/ PA21/10338 – 3 St Andrews Street, St Ives TR26 1AH

The Town Clerk read out two written statements in support of the applications

Item No. 4198 - PA21/10034 - Day Dawn Carthew Way St Ives TR26 1RJ

One speaker objected to the application

Item No. 4203 - PA21/09771 Land West of Moorlands, Towedenack Road, St Ives TR26 3AL

One speaker in support of the application.

MINUTES

P.121

RESOLVED – that the Chairman signs as a true and correct record the minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 7<sup>th</sup> October 2021.

P.122 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

P.123 PLANNING APPLICATIONS

## Planning Minutes

RESOLVED - that the Head of Development Management (Cornwall Council) be informed of the Council's observations on the planning applications set out in Annex 1 to these minutes.

124. ITEMS FOR DECISION

None

125. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

None.

Meeting closed at pm

Chairman

## **Planning Minutes**

## Planning Minutes

### St Ives Town Council

#### Planning Schedule for meeting date 11 November 2021

**Part A - applications 4169 through to 4189 have been subject to consultation with the Chairman and Vice Chairman of the Planning Committee and are recommended to the Committee for support, subject to any comments**

<i>Ref No.</i>	<i>CC Ref</i>	<i>Site (Applicant)</i>	<i>Proposal</i>	<i>Decision</i>
4169	PA21/09162	2 Toms Yard Higher Stennack St Ives Cornwall Mr Graham Pullen	Monterey Cypress - remove 3 - 4 broken branches on SW side of tree	<b>Support</b> , subject to the tree officer having no objections
4170	PA21/09320	Sand Dune House Headland Road Carbis Bay Mr And Mrs Richard And Judy Smith	Erection of contemporary, energy efficient three bedroom dwelling (revised design) with non compliance of condition 3, 5 and 9 in relation to decision notice PA20/01010 dated 02.12.2020	<b>Support</b>
4171	PA21/08812	The Bookend 4 Skidden Hill St Ives TR26 2DU Mr Ian Watkins	Listed Building Consent: Replacement door, window glass, replacement soffits and guttering and repair and replacement of fascia boards	<b>Support</b> , subject to Historic Environment being in support
4172	PA21/05894	Village Hall Fore Street Lelant TR26 3JR Mr James Douglas	Listed Building Consent: Replacement windows to main hall and front of building	<b>Support</b> , subject to Historic Environment being in support
4173	PA21/09648	1 Treloyhan Manor Drive St Ives TR26 2AD Mr Craig Sparrow	Application for works to trees covered by a Tree Preservation Order as detailed within submitted Tree Report.	<b>Support</b> , subject to the tree officer having no objections
4175	PA21/10336	Land On Beach Front West Of Surf Club Porthmeor Beach St Ives Cornwall Marine Management Organisation	Marine Management Organisation (MMO) consultation for the TwinHub Floating Offshore Wind Demonstration Project.	<b>Support</b>
4176	PA21/09537	27 The Terrace St Ives Cornwall TR26 2BP Mr T Symons	New opening in partition to enlarge dining area.	<b>Support</b>

## Planning Minutes

4177	PA21/10234	Trewartha Gallery Laity Lane Carbis Bay St Ives Cornwall TR26 2TF Griggi	Non-material amendment (NMA2) in relation to decision notice PA20/02226 for external alterations	<b>Support</b>
4178	PA21/08485	1, 1a, 3Penbeagle Crescent St Ives Cornwall TR26 2JF Mr Michael Care	Construction of parking areas to 1, 1a and 3 Penbeagle Crescent	<b>Support</b> , subject to no objections from the Highway Officer
4179	PA21/09486	2 Access To Balnoon Balnoon Lelant TR26 3JA Mr Khiem Nguyen Livewest C/O Wrekin Windows	Replacement front and rear doors	<b>Support</b>
4180	PA21/09947	2 Albert Terrace Tregenna Terrace St Ives Cornwall Mr A Livsey & Ms C David	Roof Extension	<b>Support</b>
4181	PA21/09650	Ven Ayr Fore Street Lelant TR26 3EN Mr Richard Boon	Raise canopy and remove stem with basal decay to a Monterey Cypress and reduce canopy of a Copper Beech	<b>Support</b> , subject to the tree officer having no objections
4182	PA21/09762	Piazza, Flat 11 Back Road West St Ives TR26 1NQ Emma Davies	Refurbishment of existing 2 bedroom flat including new structural openings and new windows.	<b>Support</b>
4183	PA21/09644	7 (Formerly Plot 10) Treloyhan Manor Drive St Ives Cornwall TR26 2AN Mr Oates And Mrs Dedman	G1 Zelkova tree x 2 - Remove due to proximity to permitted building.Replacement planting of 2 trees to front of garden.	<b>Support</b> , subject to the tree officer having no objections
4184	PA21/10204	Chynoweth Road Between Halsetown Road And Laity Lane Halsetown TR26 3NA Mrs Nelson	Replace existing sunroom with PVCU conservatory.	<b>Support</b> subject to the Historic Environment Officer having no objec
4185	PA21/08679	Beach Lodge Higher Boskerris Carbis Bay TR26 2TL Mr Nicholas Kenlay	Certificate of lawfulness existing use: Continued use of property as independent dwelling	No additional comments to make

## Planning Minutes

4186	PA21/09352	Tre-Porth 7 West Place St Ives TR26 1JF Mr & Mrs Layzell	New Front & Rear Dormers, Front Balcony & Single-storey Side Extension	<b>Support</b>
4187	PA21/08340	The Old Sail Lofts Bethesda Hill St Ives TR26 1PB Mr Roger Hillier	Listed Building consent to remove existing door from East Elevation and replace with new window and door. Reconfigure existing granite external steps to West Elevation.	<b>No objection</b> subject to the Historic Environment Services comments being met, that works are in strict accordance with the sequence of works and materials set out in the Heritage Impact Assessment.
4188	PA21/09414	West Lodge Church Lane Lelant St Ives Mr And Mrs Stevens	Proposed Extensions and other minor alterations	<b>Support</b>
4189	PA21/08603	Una Resort St Ives Lelant St Ives Cornwall Mr William Taylor Kingfisher Resorts	Proposed outdoor swimming pool, dedicated children's pool and an outdoor food and beverage area with associated works (revisions to amenity area approved under decision PA17/09077	<p><b>Object</b> – the Town Council objected to the original permission on the grounds that the development doesn't satisfy policy GD1 that development should be of a size and scale, sensitive to its surroundings and there is no adverse significant landscape impact. Policies LED 8 and 9 supporting holiday accommodation are subject to GD1.</p> <p>The Council's concerns relating to this specific application relate to the expansion of managed outdoor space and the addition of outdoor eating areas with the associated noise, activity, increase in traffic trips to the site. The local leisure centre and pool are under threat and would like to see an assessment of the impact of this on these existing facilities in town. It also objects to the increased use of glazing and hard landscaping. The landscaping plan and the retention of the meadow area is welcome. However, the Council would wish to see far greater emphasis on screening with trees and</p>

## Planning Minutes

				native species.
4190	PA21/09601	Pennti Morvoren 3 Headland Road Carbis Bay St Ives Mr. and Mrs. Eadington	Conversion of Existing Garage, First floor Extension over with Juliet Balcony and Removal of One Chimney.	<b>Support</b>
4191	PA21/10337	3 St Andrews Street St Ives TR26 1AH Mr David Baxendale	Replacement of windows on front elevation; replacement of rooflight; enlargement and replacement of seaward facing window to create central doorway, replacement of floorboards; reinstatement of original walls, retention of repainting of property in Farrow and Ball “Cooks Blue”	<b>Object</b> due to the implications on the listed building. Please refer to our comments in relation to the listed building application.
4192	PA21/10338	3 St Andrews Street St Ives TR26 1AH Mr David Baxendale	Listed Building consent Replacement of windows on front elevation; replacement of rooflight; enlargement and replacement of seaward facing window to create central doorway, replacement of floorboards; reinstatement of original walls, retention of repainting of property in Farrow and Ball “Cooks Blue”	<b>Object</b> The Committee objected to the application and two elements of the proposed external works, especially the proposal to paint the property in a blue paint colour and also proposed amendments to the balcony. The Council object both to the colour which would be out of keeping with the vernacular Cornish colour palette and also the proposed paint material which is not resilient or breathable. The property is within the historic core of the town and the balconies are a visually important part of the harbour front. The proposals are not in accordance with NDP policy BE2 b) designed to protect properties in the historic core of the town. Which states that developments and renovations must respect the use of materials, such as granite, slate metal guttering, <i>lime pointing and rendering</i> , along with other materials <i>in a similar palette</i> ”. All proposed works should be in accordance with the advice of the historic environment service.

## Planning Minutes

4193	PA21/08869	5A Porthgwidden Studios Carncrows Road St Ives Cornwall  Ms K Tudor	Single storey extension	<b>Strongly object</b> – contrary to NDP policy GE1, the proposals are disproportionate in scale and not sensitive to their surroundings - The extension is too dominant, protruding too far forward and breaking up the traditional terrace form. Despite reference to the Tate, the Council does not believe that the inclusion of a conical roof form is typical of the character area and neither does it represent the volume, height, street and roof lines I the adjoining streetscapes which are important contrary to BE1 and BE2.
4194	PA21/09749	Crest Mont Alexandra Road St Ives TR26 1ER  Mr & Mrs R Beazley	Proposed replacement dwelling and erection of new dwelling.	<b>No objection</b> , subject to one dwelling being subject to the NDP principal residency condition under policy H2
4195	PA21/09365	New Residential Units Plot 11 Treloyhan Manor Treloy Avenue St Ives  Mr Richard Parsons	Application for approval of Reserved Matters to Approved Outline Application No. PA14/00811 dated 7 May 2015 for Unit 11 (Appearance and Landscaping) with variation of condition 1 of decision PA18/02151 dated 19/12/2018	<b>No objection</b>
4196	PA21/09136	Orchid Gallery 2A Bedford Road St Ives Cornwall  Mr Garry Middleton-Batts	To convert and transform an existing shop into a domestic house.	<b>Conditional Support</b>  The NDP seeks to retain retail space within the town centre unless it is no longer economically viable and has been promoted as such for at least a year. (LE4) There is a low proportion of empty retail space within the town. It is not clear that the property has been empty and marketed as such for at least a year. However, given the shortage of permanent housing, the Council would support this conversion, subject to a policy H2 designation being imposed as



## Planning Minutes

				a net new dwelling.
4197	PA21/09937	2 Polgarth Close Carbis Bay TR26 2SL King	Demolish and extend existing garage to side of property to build single storey annex, to provide living area including kitchen, bathroom and 1 bedroom.	<b>Support</b> , subject to the planning officer being satisfied that the development has no significant impact upon neighbours, is not overbearing and the annexe is retained as ancillary to the dwelling and compliant with the Council's annexe guidance.
4198	PA21/10034	Day Dawn Carthew Way St Ives TR26 1RJ Mr And Mrs Harvey	Proposed extension and alterations including balcony.	<b>Objection.</b>
4199	PA21/09818	Animal Vet Services St Ives Road Carbis Bay TR26 2JX Animal Veterinary Services	Demolition of Vets and dwelling behind 28 Richmond Way and construction of 2 new semi-detached dwellings	<b>No objection</b> , subject to the Planning Officer assessment that the siting of the property within the plot meets minimum separation distances from the neighbouring property and does not cause shadowing. The Committee also expressed some concerns regarding the amount of glazing. One property must be subject to an H2 principal residence condition.
4200	PA21/09571	Land At Former Piggery Halsetown St Ives Cornwall Mr Richard Thomas	Conversion of Former Piggery to Form Residential Dwelling Subject to H2 Restrictions.	<b>Support</b> on the grounds that the property is not in conflict with GD1 and will be subject to an H2 condition and is within the Halsetown boundary and the building is not domestic in design.
4201	PA21/09732	The Cliffs Headland Road Carbis Bay TR26 2NU Lee Bryan	Alteration and extension of existing dormer window to north elevation of the second floor flat and vertical extension to rear stairwell to south elevation	<b>No objection</b>
4202	PA21/09888	The Holt Access To Rosewall Farm Towednack TR26 3AL Mr Colin Curtis	Erection of extension to dwelling	<b>No objection</b> , subject to the case officer assessment that the plot is sufficiently large enough to accommodate the extension without being unneighbourly.

**Planning Minutes**

4203	PA21/09771	Land W Of Moorlands Towednack Road St Ives TR26 3AL Mr Stephen Ayres	Proposed residential development of nine single storey residential units for those aged 55 and over.	<p><b>Objection</b></p> <p>The Committee note that the principle of development is established for this site. But is concerned to ensure that any development within the AONB and an area of great landscape value is of high quality design. The proposals result in a denser design than for the permitted scheme with a greater number of dwellings. The previous officer comments in relation to the last application and the pre-application advice indicate that there are concerns with a closely packed arrangement and the pre-app advice is for a scheme of perhaps 6 units.</p> <p>The Council believe there is a need for a high quality low impact design in this location and agree with the recommendation for the use of recessive natural materials.</p> <p>The Town Council are also concerned about a range of issues around a lack of occupancy controls for the dwellings. The description of development and the inference that these will be affordable dwellings for older people is not accurate. We understand that these will be unfettered dwellings. The committee also noted that the consented scheme provided a unilateral undertaking to offer a proportion of the dwellings to be affordable homes which is not the case here. The committee were also concerned about the potential issues for residents</p>
------	------------	---	--	---

**Planning Minutes**

				<p>surrounding park home developments in terms of occupancy, affordability and insulation and affordable warmth.</p> <p>Finally, the Committee are concerned about the appearance and design akin to a holiday home development. The adopted NDP supports catered accommodation but not additional self contained accommodation which would otherwise have an impact on the housing stock and requires all new residential accommodation to be subject to an H2 principal residence condition.</p>
4204	PA21/10095	Archways Porthrepta Road Carbis Bay St Ives Mr & Mrs Ian & Gillian Seabury	Proposed Alterations and Extension	No objection
4205	PA21/09545	Porthminster Beach Porthminster St Ives Cornwall	Proposed new putting green kiosk (revision of PA20/08796)	No objection
4206	PA21/08395	Porthgwidden Beach Cafe Porthgwidden St Ives Cornwall TR26 1PL	Proposed alteration to create additional outside seating area on side (south) elevation (Resubmission of expired planning consent PA17/07711)	No objection.